

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

HPK/2024/0432 43 HIGH STREET
Valid 15/10/2024 BUXTON

REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING ORIGINAL TIMBER WINDOWS AND REPLACEMENT OF VICTORIAN SLIDING SASH. CLEAN, REPAIR AND ENCAPSULATION OF VICTORIAN STAINED-GLASS PANES. INSTALLATION OF ONE ROOF LIGHT TO THE SOUTHERN ELEVATION AND REPLACEMENT LIGHT TO THE SMALL ROOF ON THE EASTERN ELEVATION

(FULL - MINOR)

MAIN ISSUES

- Heritage – Conservation area
- Design
- Amenity

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application relates to flats A and B at 43 High Street in Buxton. 43 High street is an end terrace property with a shop at the ground floor, and prominent arts and crafts style bay window on the upper floors. The side elevation runs along Ash St, and features a number of original timber sash windows, including a dormer window to flat B. The application site is located within the Buxton Central conservation area.



PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for replacement windows throughout, and the installation of two new roof lights.

It is proposed to replace the existing single paned timber window to the front bay with window type A (WT A). WT A will be an timber (Accoya) framed window with weatherproof seal and painted to match existing. The frames will be increased to allow for double glazing. The second floor stained glass will be encased within new double glazed units.

The side and rear timber sash windows will be replaced with window type B (WT B). WT B proposes a heritage uPVC 2 over 2 sliding sash window. The windows have been selected from the Legacy range and to 'timber effect'. Where there is stained glass on the second floor this will be encapsulated into a double glazed unit.

The southern facing roof lights to flat 43b will be a velux rooflight with central glazing bar. The east facing roof light will be a smaller velux rooflight to replace and existing dilapidated plane of glass.

Since the initial submission, additional details have been submitted providing additional details of the proposed window manufacture, including sectional details. Additional details have also included a condition report of the existing windows.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

High Peak Local Plan 2016

S 1 Sustainable Development Principles
S 1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
S 2 Settlement Hierarchy
EQ 6 Design and Place Making
EQ 7 Built and Historic Environment
CF 6 Accessibility and Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Section 12 Achieving well-designed places
Section 16 Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

HPK/0002/2908 Conversion Of Maisonette Into Two Flats APPROVED 08/05/1985

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 26/11/2024
Neighbour consultation period ends: 03/01/2025
Press Advert: 21/11/2024

Public Comments

Neither (1)

'Positive and respectful restoration of a town heritage asset'

Support (1)

'Excellent to see restoration of heritage assets'

Objection (2)

- Inappropriate in the Buxton conservation area
- The site is a prominent building with distinctive Arts and Crafts style black and white timber details. 'It is illustrated in the Conservation Area character statement as one of a group of four similar properties, and fortunately there is a good retention of original detailing across the group.'
- Concerns that encapsulating stained glass won't have satisfactory visual effect.
- Historic England guidance in Advice Note 18 'Adapting Historic Buildings for Energy and Carbon Efficiency' should be followed.
- Historic England's advice is clear & unambiguous on this issue - repair the existing windows & fit internal secondary glazing.
- A secondary glazing system should be explored
- Ash St elevation is a prominent elevation on the corner as you rise up into Buxton from the London Rd Junction. Windows appear capable of repair.
- Timber rails to be thicker than original timber
- Side elevation visible from the High St and will have a detrimental effect on this street scene.
- Loss of original window glass
- uPVC windows unlikely to last as long as original timber windows.
- Materials and techniques should be appropriate to the age of the windows.
- Historic England Advice Note 14: Energy Efficiency and Traditional Homes – 'The 'whole building approach' ensures that works are effective and sustainable in the long term and will not inadvertently damage the operation and character of the building or harm the health of occupants. Not all energy efficiency measures that work for new buildings are suitable for older properties because traditional building construction and materials work differently'

Town / Parish Comments

n/a

Environmental Health

n/a

Derbyshire County Council Highways

No objection

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

Local Plan (LP) Policy S 2 states that development should be directed towards sustainable locations, including Market Towns such as Buxton. The site is situated within this built-up area boundary. However as the site also lies within the conservation area, the principle of the development will only be acceptable subject to consideration of heritage asset policy.

Design and heritage

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 Requires Local Planning Authorities to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

Section 16 Paragraph 212 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Section 12 Paragraph 135(c) of the NPPF states that development should be sympathetic to the character and history of the area, while not restricting change.

LP Policy EQ 6 states that all development should be well designed, of a high quality and respond to the areas character, history and scale

LP Policy EQ 7 states that the council will conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance.

The Buxton Conservation Area Character Appraisal (BCACA) states: ' The scale of buildings changes in the southern part of High Street. The group of four early 20th century three storey buildings on the east side of the street (Nos. 41-47), incorporating distinctive black and white timbering, have a strong identity when viewed from the north, and were once reflected in the character of a similar building opposite, but this was demolished and has left an ugly "gapsite"'

No.43, along with its enighbours, is therefore mentioned as a notable building within the Buxton Central conservation area, making up one of four distinct properties along the High Street, due to their arts and crafts bay windows. A condition report has demonstrated that the bay window is in structurally sound condition, however the window frames themselves are failing (see images in Heritage statement). Upon closer inspection a number of the original arts and crafts stained glass windows are

cracked. It is considered that sufficient evidence has been submitted to support the need to replace the existing timber framed windows, to both the principle and side elevations. As such the existing damage would not be overcome by the installation of secondary glazing, therefore, the requirement for replacement is satisfied. It is noted that an objector has raised a number of concerns regarding the proposed windows.

The WT A windows proposed for the front bay will be of a hardwood timber frame, with double glazed units. The existing stained glass will be carefully removed and encapsulated within the new frames. The existing glass at the first floor is not considered to be original glass, and as such its loss is negligible. The proposed encapsulation of the stained glass allows for the existing glass to be retained, while preventing further damage to the original glass panels. It is unfortunate that the visual effect of the stained glass may be lessened, however, the protection of the stained glass is considered of higher value to maintaining the appearance of the conservation area. The proposed WTA is therefore considered acceptable to provide a like for like external appearance of the bay windows and is therefore considered acceptable.

WT B presents a heritage uPVC sash by Legacy. Examples have been provided of these windows installed elsewhere, to a high finish. The loss of the original windows is unfortunate, however, the condition report and supporting heritage statement satisfy that these windows are beyond reasonable repair and therefore require replacement. uPVC windows are not typically acceptable within the Buxton Central conservation area. However, in this case the windows are located along Ash street, which due to previous replacements on other buildings including those on the opposite side of the street, has lost almost all of its original timber windows. All replacement windows along Ash St are of poor-quality uPVC (figure 1) and introduce an eyesore to the conservation area. Windows along Ash St are varied in design, with a combination of casement style windows of a 1 over 1 style.



Figure 1 – Ash Street

The applicant has provided additional information to support the proposed WT B and demonstrate that these windows will not exacerbate the existing poor state of Ash St. The proposed heritage uPVC is considered to be like for like in appearance to the existing timber windows and of a high quality. The glimpse views of the side windows available from High Street will not harm the conservation area and will sustain this viewpoint. The proposed windows will introduce a higher standard of uPVC to Ash St, likewise sustaining the conservation area.

The south facing roof light is of a dark colour with central glazing bar. Some views of this window may be visible from the London Rd junction. However, these views will be minimal. As such the proposed roof light is not considered to harm the character and appearance of the conservation area. The east facing roof light will be replaced and the roof light will be located to the rear of the dwelling. This window is almost completely hidden from view from the street scene, due to its location at the rear of the building in close proximity to neighbouring buildings. As such this has no impact upon the conservation area.

It is noted that the objectors refer to Historic England Advice Notes 14 and 18, and although material planning considerations, for the above reasons it is concluded that the applicant has demonstrated that the existing windows cannot be repaired, and even with the addition of secondary glazing would not lead to any substantive improvements to the existing window frames. Therefore, the proposed replacement windows are considered to be acceptable.

Overall, while the loss of the original timber is unfortunate it has been proven that they are beyond repair and require replacement. However, the windows on the west elevation, which is the most prominent elevation, will be replaced with timber hardwood, which is welcomed. The proposed replacement side facing windows, despite being uPVC, are a high-quality product which are considered sympathetic to the Buxton Central conservation area. Moreover, the design of all new windows would be on a like for like basis, when compared to the existing windows. As such the proposals are considered acceptable in terms of design and would sustain the importance of the heritage asset.

Amenity

LP Policy EQ 6 states that all development should achieve a satisfactory relationship to adjacent development and doesn't cause unacceptable effects by reason of vision intrusion, overlooking, shadowing, overbearing effect, noise, light pollution or other adverse impacts on local character and amenity.

The Adopted Residential (SPD) (2005) paragraph 8.6.1 states that there should be 21 metres between adjacent inhabitable windows to provide an acceptable level of amenity.

The replacement of the existing front and side windows and east facing rooflight will reuse existing opening and as such will not alter the existing relationship with adjacent dwellings.

The proposed south facing rooflight will face towards the side of no.45 high street. The side of this elevation has no window at second floor level. As such the proposed rooflight will not cause any overlooking or privacy concerns.

Overall there are no amenity concerns.

Highway Safety

The proposal relates to windows on the first and second floor only. As such there will be no impact upon highway safety.

Nutrient Neutrality

The site lies within the catchment of the River Wye which forms the Peak District Dales Special Area of Conservation (SAC). The Council has been notified that action must be taken to address exceedances of phosphorus in the River. As such, the Council cannot grant consent for development unless it can rule out "likely significant effects" on the SAC. A Habitats Regulations Assessment (HRA) will be required when the plan or project creates a source of water pollution or has an impact on water quality and when it is within the catchment of the SAC. Initially, a screening assessment will be required to consider if "likely significant effects" (alone or in-combination) on the SAC can be ruled out. If not, this will be followed by an "Appropriate Assessment" where the impact of the plan or project is considered in detail.

Screening Assessment

The proposal is not directly connected with or necessary for the conservation management of a European site. The proposal will not increase overnight stays or surface water run-off from the site. Therefore it will not risk having a significant negative effect on the SAC either on its own or in combination with other proposals and therefore it is not necessary to carry out an Appropriate Assessment

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

Following the submission of revised information the development is considered acceptable in terms of design, heritage amenity and highway safety. It is considered to be in accord with the relevant policies put forward in the Local Plan and the NPPF. Therefore this application is recommended for approval.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : Approval

Case Officer: Rachel Robinson

Recommendation Date: 31st January 2025

X 

Signed by: Jane Colley Signature

On behalf of High Peak Borough Council