

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

HPK/2023/0544 & HPK/2023/0545 Valid 03/01/2024	3 THE OLD CLUBHOUSE WATER STREET BUXTON	FULL PLANNING AND LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR PROPOSED INTERNAL ALTERATIONS AND REFURBISHMENT OF THE PREMISES AT GROUND AND FIRST FLOOR LEVELS, AND EXTERNAL PATIO AREA ALTERATIONS TO ADD NEW PAVING, AND NEW WROUGHT IRON RAILINGS TO THE STONE BOUNDARY WALL.
--	---	---

(FULL - MINOR)

MAIN ISSUES

- Design and Conservation

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application relates to 'The Old Clubhouse' Public House, a Grade II Listed Building that situated adjacent to Water Street (to the south, east and west), and the A54 (to the north), between St Johns Church and Buxton Opera House, and within close proximity to the Pavilion Gardens.

A number of sensitive heritage assets lie within close proximity to the site and thus any proposed development to the exterior of the building has the potential to affect their setting, as well as the character and appearance of the Listed Building to which it relates.

The site lies within Buxton Town Centre and the Buxton Central Conservation Area as defined on the Local Plan Proposals Map.

The principal elevation of the Public House faces southwards towards the Buxton Opera House, the building being situated in a highly prominent and elevated location when viewed from the south. Likewise, the eastern elevation of the building which fronts a small area of soft landscaping which provides relief from the predominantly urban character, is also prominent.

PROPOSAL

This application as submitted sought Listed Building Consent for various proposed internal and external works that are summarised below, as set out within the accompanying Design, Access and Heritage Statement:

Ground Floor Area (Internal)

- Minor refurbishment of internal finishes to main customer areas, carried out on a like for like basis, with some walls having new wallpaper finishes as shown on accompanying plans. Redecoration works will retain existing features of interior, including cornices, skirtings, dado rails etc.
- Refurbishment of floor finishes throughout the ground floor areas, with existing modern carpet flooring, vinyl flooring and entrance matting removed, and new floor finishes added. Wooden floors to be retained where present, and sanded, re-stained and re-polished.
- Reduction of the timber raised floor in Dining Area, to bring a section of floor level with the main lower floor level.
- Formation of a new glass wash area located between the bar counter and the kitchen area, by adding new stud walling built up full height within the existing customer area. New vinyl flooring will be added in this area. No structural alterations to the existing buildings.
- Minor alterations to the existing Coffee Station within the 'transitional' area to relocate the existing worktop and units to the adjoining wall, together with new timber and glazed screen and WC door.
- The addition of a new timber drinks shelf to the wall between the bar and kitchen.
- Removal of circular drinks shelf around an existing column in the dining area. This will remove a modern addition and is intended to provide additional floor space in this area used for dining. Existing circular column will be retained.

Ground Floor Area (External)

- Alterations to existing patio area to the east of the site, to extend the existing stone paved surface into an unused area of bark mulch, adding additional paved surface for customer seating
- Addition of new painted wrought iron railings to the boundary wall on the eastern boundary. New 40mm x 40mm box section posts will be set into the top of the stone wall, with flat bar horizontal rails fitted between to provide the support for the vertical bar uprights, painted black.
- Addition of new 4.0m x 4.0m umbrella located in patio area to the east of the site, having single central pole, square fabric canopy. The central pole will be set into a steel ground socket, which allows removal of the umbrella.

- Removal of some existing timber seating on existing stone boundary wall to east of the site, with new timber seating re-applied in the same area, intended as maintenance work to the existing dilapidated seating.
- Addition of new lanterns and curved support brackets above two existing entrance doors to the north and south sides of the building. Lanterns supplied by specialists. Lanterns and supported brackets will be in a traditional style that is fully in keeping with the buildings appearance.

Mezzanine Floor Area (Internal)

- Full refurbishment of the existing Ladies and Gents toilet areas, involving new wall and floor finishes and new sanitary ware to replace existing. Cubicles to have IPS back panels added to hid toilet cisterns.
- Existing Gents toilet cubicles to be removed and replaced with new cubicle walls and doors. Does not involve alterations to building structure.

First Floor Area (Internal)

- Internal alterations to create new office and store areas, formed by introducing full height stud walls, scribed around existing skirtings, cornices, and dado rails to retain such features. Existing walk in fridge to be removed. Existing bar counter to be retained.
- Minor refurbishment of internal finishes to the main customer areas, with redecorations carried out to walls, ceilings, skirtings and dado rails. Redecorations will be carried out on a 'like for like' basis. Some walls to have new wallpaper finishes as per drawings.
- Alterations to block up 2no. existing window openings in Ladies toilet area, carried out by the use of timber stud and plasterboard infills to existing window openings only, and existing windows to be retained.
- Addition of new retractable black out blinds and ceiling mounted projector unit and screen to Function Room. Blinds cartridge brackets will be screw fixed to the wall reveals – no fixings will be made into the window frames. Existing window will remain unaffected. No cornices or beams in this area will be affected.
- Removal of existing free standing carvery unit in Function Room, which involves making good areas of floor where this unit has stood, achieved to match surrounding surfaces.
- Existing handrails and balusters to Function Room raised floor will be checked, and where required any loose balusters will be properly fixed in place.

Further to ongoing dialogue with Officers and the Council's Conservation Officer, the site has been subject to amendments as shown by revised plans, most notably the omission of the large umbrella. The final set of plans subject to assessment within this report is set out as follows:

- First Floor Layout as Proposed (Ref: 1295-P-04C)
- External Elevations as Proposed (Ref: 1295-P-06C)
- Site Location Plan and Block Plan (Ref: 1295-P-07A)
- Glass Wash Area Wall Elevations (Ref: 1295-P-08A)

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Act 2004 requires proposals to be determined in accordance with the Development Plan taking into consideration any material considerations relevant to the determination of the application.

The Local Development Plan for this site comprises the High Peak Local Plan (2016). Adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance documents and the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) are also material considerations in determining applications.

High Peak Local Plan 2016

- S1 Sustainable Development Principles
- S1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
- S7 Buxton Sub-area Strategy
- EQ6 Design and Place Making
- EQ7 Built and Historic Environment

Supplementary Planning Documents

High Peak Design Guide SPD (2018)

National Planning Policy Framework 2023

- | | |
|---|------------|
| Achieving Sustainable Development | Chapter 2 |
| Achieving Well Designed and Beautiful Places | Chapter 12 |
| Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment | Chapter 16 |

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

The site has a long planning history due to the fact that it is a listed building within the conservation area. However, none of the previous planning history (relating mostly to signage) is considered to be relevant to the assessment and determination of this application.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 15th February 2024
Neighbour consultation period ends: 30th January 2024
Press Advert: 8th February 2024

Public Comments

None

Town / Parish Comments

N/A

Historic England

No comments to make

DCC Archaeology

No objections

HPBC Conservation Officer

Initial Comments

OBJECTION

The proposed plans denote a 'chevron timber flooring' – is this original parquet flooring? It is not clear. The method of care including new polish colours will need revisiting if so. Clarity required.

I am not confident about a 'jumbrella' with lights and heaters. This is a particularly sensitive area closely adjacent to the Opera House, the Conservatory, the Old Hall Inn, Pavillion Gardens RPG and 1-6 The Square which is Grade II*. A few high profile assets in the area, though not limited to, that have not been assessed in terms of setting and impact. I don't feel this generic oversized umbrella is sensitive to this core vicinity, and unfortunately looks to be additional clutter that does not enhance the Clubhouse, or sit subserviently in this location. I recommend its omission from the scheme in order to preserve the traditional open and relaxed feel of the pubs appearance and character, and in order to avoid harm on the setting of these assets.

Other items to note:

There are a few specific items mentioned in the listing description with regard to internal features. It is mentioned in the proposed that the majority of the internal works to finishes are cosmetics like paints and wallpaper. Though I will mention the removal of any previous paints and wallpapers (I presume will occur part of the refurb?) during this needs to be made clear in order to avoid any over invasive methods, use of harmful chemicals etc and to prevent damage. It may perhaps be useful to have a brief summary of materials and methods for this element to ensure

original timber joinery, detailing and moulding and associated items are not lost or damaged during this process.

A section of the existing and proposed glass wash area will provide more clarity and enable me to give a sound response. Why is it needed? There is little information surrounding this and I cannot envisage it.

New wrought iron railings – is there any evidence they were the original conditions? Or are they brand new features? I cannot see clear and convincing justification for this currently. I also cannot see how this and new wall seats at the same location is feasible?

Lanterns – there is one at the principal frontage above the main door, facing the Opera House. Though I don't see a need for one to the rear as well. The traditional form of this building is that its 'back' sits flanked to the road (A53) as always has done, with the impressive frontage turned away and hugging the open area at the front. It is therefore of historic interest that the conscious features and respective decorations are not also at the back. Uniformity is not found here. The rear is a substantially different elevation on purpose. Quiet, humble, and modest with some irregularities and the appearance of an unassuming building from this perspective, almost creating the air of exclusivity (as Clubhouses by name once in fact were); one that it can only be fully appreciated from the other side – the principal frontage. I do not see it as an enhancement or something that harmonises with the character of the building. I recommend its omission and a new lantern unit to the principal frontage only. Design, style, siting and attachment to be secured by condition.

I will await further information before providing final comment.

Further Comments

In response to revised plans and supporting commentary submitted by the agent:

It would be wise to confirm the proposed new treatment and finish once the flooring is revitalised, as this parquet is an extensive feature throughout extending into the larger seating area, and would be wise to keep it subtle and sensitive. i.e. perhaps natural timber staining and not for example bright timber reds and heavy orange stains as many choices are available. This can then perhaps be positively conditioned.

Revisions showing the removal of the proposed 'Jumbrella' are acceptable.

In response to details and clarification regarding the new stud wall and glass wash area, with painted or tiled finished this is understood and perhaps should be conditioned that once all reasonable and necessary demand for its use and placement has ceased that this area be reverted back to its original condition. However before I can confirm this - a final note on this would be to ascertain whether invasive methods are required, to provide any new water input and output to this element where otherwise there might not be any within the envelope of the fabric?

The method statement is pertinent as there are more than likely surviving laths and plaster notwithstanding other elements covered under this query.

Removal of timber seats from stone boundary walling, and replacement with railings are noted and acceptable. A condition to be invited to control design, style, size, colour and material of new railings which should include their method of construction into the existing stone. From memory if there are iron studs surviving from previous railings within the stone, this is to be investigated first, and perhaps should inform a summary of works condition to prevent total loss and or substantial damage of the original stone walling.

In response to the removal of the above door lantern and brackets from St Johns Road entrance, and indication of smaller wall mounted half lanterns to the sides of the entrance door, the thought behind this is understood. However in light of my initial appraisal, my previous comments are echoed. I believe there will be a less invasive and perhaps less permanent way of achieving this if there is identified a priority, as again I don't see an overarching material need at the moment. I don't see this as an enhancement where there is a concise and designed form and cohesion to this listed building. The entrance is at the principal frontage and is legible as such. The installation of new lighting where otherwise there hasn't been any, will also involve new infrastructure and new disturbance of the structural envelope. It appeared more recently a small white light unit had already been affixed to the stone surround here, I am unsure as to whether it was temporary or not as it would not be something supported as an alternative and consequently advise its removal if not already done so.

Final Comments

Revised Plans (4th June) acceptable subject to conditions:

1. *Prior to installation of the new railings, the details of the design, colour and finish, sizes including height and space between each bar, material and style including any finials are to be submitted to the Local Planning Authority. The new railings must be a close match to those in existence at St Johns Road elevation. The measurements and sizes should be shown in detail at 1:20 and with context at 1:100. Once approved in writing the development shall be undertaken in strict accordance to this specification and last for the lifetime of the development.*

Reason: to protect and conserve the character of the listed building within the Conservation Area.

Environmental Health

If there are any existing restrictions on the use of the outside seating area (hours, lighting, music etc.) these should be carried forward onto any approval. Other than that, no further comments.

Derbyshire County Council Highways

No objections

OFFICER COMMENTS

Design and Conservation

Section 66(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 72(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that with respect to any buildings or land in a conservation area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of that area.

LP Policy S1 sets out a number of sustainability principles which all new development proposals should incorporate in order to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protect, and where possible enhance the environment.

LP Policy EQ6 states that all development should be well designed to respect and contribute positively to the character, identity and context of High Peak's townscapes, having regard to matters of scale, height, density, layout, appearance and materials.

LP Policy EQ7 has regard to the Built and Historic Environment. It states that the Council will conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance. This will take into account the desirability of sustaining and enhancing their significance and will ensure that development proposals contribute positively to the character of the built and historic environment.

Chapter 5 of the High Peak Design Guide SPD (2018) contains useful guidance relating to the alteration and extension of existing buildings. Relevant guidance include the following:

5.2 Alterations need to be undertaken with care. Insensitive changes can easily spoil a building. The key to a sensitive approach is to take note of what is there already before preparing the design and to work with, and not against, the buildings' character. The aim should be to revitalise the building without altering its fundamental character.

Paragraph 135 of the NPPF states amongst other things that decisions should ensure that developments will add to the overall quality of the area; are visually attractive as a result of good architecture; and are sympathetic to the surrounding built environment.

Paragraphs 205-209 of the NPPF sets out how a local planning authority should assess the significance of a heritage asset and how to assess the potential impacts of a specific development proposal upon that asset. Where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to (or total loss of significance of) a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or total loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm. Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.

Full Planning permission and Listed Building Consent is sought for various alterations and extensions to the Grade II Listed Old Clubhouse public house, that lies in a highly prominent and sensitive location within the Buxton Central Conservation Area, within close proximity to and within the setting of other Listed Buildings, most notably the Buxton Opera House. As such, the applications must be handled in a careful and sensitive manner.

The plans as submitted were the subject of a strong and lengthy objection from the Conservation Officer, as set out in full within this report above. From thereon, constructive and positive dialogue has been ongoing with the applicant's agent with the focus on addressing each issue within the initial objection.

The first set of revised plans showed the removal of the 'Jumbrella', thereby addressing a significant concern with regards to design and impact on the character and appearance of the street scene and heritage assets. The first set of revisions also saw the removed of timber seats from the stone boundary wall and lantern and brackets above the entrance door to St Johns Road. These plans were also accompanied by confirmation and clarification in relation to the 'transitional area' at ground floor level, and details showing a new stud wall forming the Glass Wash area.

Further discussions resulted in a second set of revised plans being received together with points of clarification and response to further comments by the Conservation Area, in relation to the parquet flooring, glass wash area, painted surfaces, and external railings.

The final (third iteration) of revised plans received on 4th June have been reviewed by the Conservation Officer and have been found to be acceptable, subject to a condition which seeks to control and secure details of the proposed railings prior to installation. Taking account of this detailed internal expertise, Officers are content that all initial concerns have been satisfactorily addressed, and that subject to appropriate conditions, the proposed development will preserve the architectural and historic fabric of the Listed Building, and the wider character and appearance of the street scene and setting of the Conservation Area and nearby Listed Buildings, in accordance with LP Policies S1, EQ6 and EQ7, relevant Supplementary Design Guidance, and relevant paragraphs under Chapters 12 and 16 of the NPPF, the latter underpinned by Sections 66 and 72 of the Act 1990.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

LP Policy S1a reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.

Paragraph 11 of the NPPF sets out the presumption in favour of sustainable development. For decision taking, this means approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or, where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are most important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission, unless:

- the application of policies in this Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or
- any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in this Framework taken as a whole.

The applicant seeks Full Planning permission and Listed Building Consent for various works and alterations to the Grade II Listed Old Clubhouse public house, that lies in a highly prominent and sensitive location within the Buxton Central Conservation Area, within close proximity to a number of similarly sensitive heritage assets.

In its original submitted form, the proposals raised significant concerns with regards to its design taken as a whole, and its potential impact on both the historic and architectural interest of the building, and the wider street scene and setting of the Buxton Central Conservation Area and heritage assets nearby.

Following an ongoing constructive dialogue between Officers, the agent, and the Council's Conservation Officer, the applicant has produced a revised scheme (as per plans submitted 4th June 2024) that have, subject to appropriate conditions which includes securing the specific details of external railings, been found to preserve historic and architectural interest of the Listed Building and the wider character and appearance of the street scene and setting of the Conservation Area and nearby Listed Buildings, in accordance with LP Policies S1, EQ6 and EQ7, relevant Supplementary Design Guidance, and relevant paragraphs under Chapters 12 and restrictive paragraphs under Chapter 16 of the NPPF, the latter underpinned by Sections 66 and 72 of the Act 1990.

As such, the applications in their final revised form are considered to amount to a sustainable form of development and in line with LP Policy S1a and Paragraph 11 of the NPPF are recommended for approval subject to appropriate conditions.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : **Approve Planning Permission and LBC with Conditions**

Case Officer: James Stannard

Recommendation Date: 18th June 2024

X *B.S. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of High Peak Borough Council